Dear Erwin Dreyer,

Thanks you for having conducted the review of our manuscript. I also thanks the reviewer for their constructive and thorough comments on our work. I am glad that you and the reviewers are satisfied with the revisions we've made and that our article can now be recommended in Peer Community In Forest & Wood Sciences.

I updated the manuscript to take into account your last suggestions. You will find below a comment for each suggestion.

Sincerely,

Camille Rouet

Valence, August 28, 2024.

- - - -

Ok. For information, the new version of the manuscript (V3 on bioRxiv) has a two-column layout and no numbering.

It was done and some minor corrections were made.

The data set is cited in the main text using a classical format (Rouet, C., Morin, X., Druel, A., 2024. Inputs, results data and analysis script for the evaluation of the PDG-Arena forest growth model on beech-fir stands. doi:10.5281/zenodo.12191049.)

I'am not sure to which list of data files and code page you're referring to. The only supplementary materials related to this paper are :

1) the PDG-Arena code that is accessible on the Capsis platform, only to members of the Capsis community. The code is not fully open yet because it is part of a previously existing model. If desired, a

discussion could be started with authors of CASTANEA and PDG to make it open. (In addition, a description of PDG-Arena will soon be added on the Capsis website.)

2) the Zenodo repository, which includes input data, the results data set and analysis script (https://zenodo.org/records/12191049).

If the URL you mentioned is on the PCI submission form and is not related to the Zenodo repository 12191049, then you can remove it.

Contributions are given in the section "6.1. Author contributions", using this taxonomy (which I think is CRediT): https://www.elsevier.com/authors/policies-and-guidelines/credit-author-statement

A proper title has been given to the data set and the appropriate co-authors has been added (see the above citation).

A new section "2.5 Access to model and data" was added in the main text (at the end of "2. Materials & Methods" section). It replaces the previous "Repository" subsection which was in the "6. Declarations" section. Section 2.5 firstly describes how the model is accessible, its integration into Capsis and how it can be run. Secondly, the section describes in more detail the files of the data set repository (which includes input data set, results data set and scripts).

I don't understand to which DOI you're referring to. The model code is only on the Capsis platform and does not have any DOI.

Please see above.

Ok.